Re. RESIGNATION OF SHRI A K ANTONY, MINISTER OF CIVIL SUPPLIES

SHRI S, JAIPAL REDDY (Andhra Pradesh): Madam, Deputy Chairperson, Mr, A. K. Antony has resigned from the Council of Ministers. I congratulate him on his lofty act and, as I said during the Quetion Hour, he has no business to remain as- a Minister in this Council of Ministers which is otherwise entirely dishonourable.

Madam, why did Mr. A. K. Antonv resign? In answer to a question—which I read out yesterday—the Government has told Parliament that the Gian Pra-kash Committee report said that the Cabinet or the Prime Minister was not told by the Cabinet Committee on Pri ces (CCP) and also by the Civil Supplies Ministry. This conclusion of the Gian Prakasli Committee is entirely in correct. I may, jn this connection, bring to the notice of the House a letter written by the then Cabinet Secretary, Mr. Zafar Saifullah, on September 8, 1994. In his letter to the Prime Minister he condemned fhe questionnaire circulated by ihe Gian Prakash Committee and said the questionnaire comprised leading ques-i ions and pie-conceptions'. And he further stated in (he answers given to the questionnaire that the minutes of the CCP were invariably maked by the Prime Minister's Office. That is what the Cabinet Secretary wrote to the Prime Minister. The then Cabinet (Secretary another letter. Madam, 1 am quoting from the letters, and 1 should be allowed to place them on the Table of the House after I authenticate them

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Are you quoting it from a newspaper report br from some ether document?

SHRI S. 1AIPAL REDDY: 1 am quoting this from an official document.

SHRI G. G. SWELL (Meghalaya); He has to lay them on the Tab1t- of (he House. Otherwise, we shall lay him on the Table.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: It will not serve the purpose

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY: Madam, I am quoting from the third page of the answers given by the then Cabinet Secre-tary to the Gian Prakash Committee; "The copies of minutes of CCP and of Committee of Secretaries were invariably marked to the Principal Secretary to the Prime Minister, and this practice is obviously to enable him to fulfil his responsibility of keeping the PM informed."

Madam, the former Cabinet Secretary wrote another letter to the Prime Minister on October 8, 1994, drawing his attention to the news item that appeared in the "ASIAN AGE", according to which the then Cabinet Secretary was also indicated. Lie took objection to the leakage of the news item, and in that letter the then Cabinet Secretary, Mr. Zafar Saifullah, holds Mr. A. N. Verma responsible for the leakage of the news item. Let me quote from it:

> "It is significant that Shri Ajay Kalsi, son of Shri D. N. Kalsi, js both on the board and js a substantial investor in this newspaper namely, the "ASIAN AGE". The close relationship between the Kalsi. family and the Gian Prakash family is a matter of record. The close relationship between Shri D. N. Kalsi and Shri Amarnath Verma, Principal Secretary to PM is far too well known. That only this paper has been able to access to this document or at least a purportedly authoritative idea of its content so swiftly is revealing.

This was | he contention of the then Cabinet Secretary. Madam, in the light of this, you may kindly note that our objections about the manner in which i he Gian Prakasli Committee was con-I Mimed and about the manner in which , this paper has been able to have had been picked up from the debris and 'iusted off and put on the throne have all been proved to be tenable.

Madam, I am reading from the minu tes of the CCP mi Id on 15-12-93, exactly a year ago. T am reading from the minutes:

"As per the latest estimate, the production of sugar was expected to be around 107 lakh tonnes in the year 1993-94. The Minister of Food was, however, hopeful that it would go up to around 115 lakh tonnes with the various steps taken and **the** incentives proposed to be offered. In particular, the incentive given by way of price control of molasses, ____

I want the Samajwadi Party Members from U.P. to note it.

SHRI JAGESH DESAI (Maharashtra): Why only they? Why not we also?

SHRI S. IAIPAL REDDY: No.

".. .the announcement of a minimum statutory price in advance of planning season and clearance of arrears of payment for sugarcane are all expected !" (jive boost to sugar production."

Mr. Kalap Nath Rai saij in this House that the decontrol of molasses led to decline in the sugar production; while is the CCP he pleaded that it would "v-i to increase in the sugar prod" :w of the likely increase in pro duction, the Ministry felt"—the Min istry here is the Food Ministry ----------"that there was no cause for anxiety and the situation would be monitored cafi

1 am referring to the nexl part now. "The Minister (Civil Supplies), how ever, feared that then: was a genuine. *[Ifiti frit* '.'■" i I

THE MINISTER. OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF PER50NNAL, PUBLIC GRIEVANCE AND PENSIONS AND THE MINISTER OF. STATf IN THE MINIS! RY Ol PARLIAMENTARY I HRIMATI MARGARET ALVA5: fcfBdam, are we now having "ii sugar. . .[1]

SHRI S. JAIPAI REDDY: 1 am referring to ihis ih the context of the .resignation of Mr. Antony. Mrs. Alva, you it have the documents avjilable wiiii you. Let me make them available to you. *(Interruptions)* Let m; say this for the record ,Of the House that I am idiflg out from the minutes of the CCP, Cabinet Committee on Prices.

SHRI IAGESH DESAI: Have you got information about the period earlier than December? *(Interruptions)*

SHRIMATI IAYANTHI NATRAIAN: Madam, how can we believe that these are the minutes of the Cabiuet Com-e on Prices?

SHRI S. IAIPAL REDDY: You cai-lenge; I can authenticate thsm and lay on the Table of the House. I seek the permission of the Chair.. .*(Interruptions)* .

विपक्ष के नेता (श्री सिकन्दर बख्त): जो कुछ हाउस में हो रहा है, वह बड़े सलीके से चल रहा है, लिहाजा इसको आप खत्म करने दें, दखल न दें वरना दखल देने का सिलसिला शुरू होगा तो हर एक कर सकता है। मेहरबानी करके आप सलीके से इस मामले को चलने दीजिए। . . (**व्यवधान**).

†[]شری سکندر بخت: جو کچھ ہاؤس میں ہو رہا ہے۔ وہ بڑے سلیقے سے چل رہا ہے۔ لہذا اس کو آپ ختم کرنے دیں دخل نہ دیں۔ دریغہ دخل دینے کا سلسلہ شروع ہوگا تو ہر ایک کر سکتا ہے۔ مہربانی کر کے آپ سلیقے سے اس معاملے کو چلنے دیجئے۔ . . مداخلت . . .

श्री त्रिलोकी नाथ चतुर्वेदी: (उत्तर प्रदेश) आपके मिनिस्टरों ने दिये हैं। . . (**व्यवधान**) . . .

श्री एस०एस० अहलुवालिया: (बिहार) आप चुप रहिए (**व्यवधान**) बैठिए। (**व्यवधान**)

†[]Transliteratiin in Arabic Script.

श्री सिकन्दर बख्त : आप बैठने का इशारा न किया करें मेहरबानी कर के । जिस तरह से आप हाथ चलाते हैं।

شری سکندر بخت: آپ بیٹھنے کا
اشارہ نہ کیا کریں، مہربانی کر کے۔ جس
طرح سے آپ ہاتھ چلاتے ہیں۔

It is not propsi jo raise hands like thi6.

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARA-JAN (Tamil Nadu): Madam, may I raise a point of order? I do not want them to interrupt. We are all equally concerned about Mr. Antony's r-cigna-lion. All of Us are worried aboi't it. We are deeply worried about Mr. Antony resignation. Madam, they had received the permission $_0$f trK Chairman ^o speak during the Question Hour and he per-mitted them. But my point of order *h* how can you permit the reading out tho minutes of the Cabinet Committee in the House?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN; How did he "et it?

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARA-JAN: Under the Official Secrets Act, he should not be reading from the document.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: He is autbenfartiflg the document.

SHRIf S. S. AHLUWALIA; Madam, it i_s a secret document. He should not be allowed to read here.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: How he go_t it?

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARA-JAN: How he got it is irrelevant.

THH DEPUTY CHAIRMAN; How is it irrelevant?

† [] Trans! iteratiin in Arabic Script.

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARA-JAN: The point is, can you permit him? *{Interruptions)* Madam, you give a ruling on whether he can be permitted to read it. Wherefiom he got it or how he got it is a different issue. Can he be permitted to read it in violation of the Official Secrets Act? *(Interruptions)*

SHRI MOHMMED AFZAL *alias* MEEM AFZAL (Uttar Pradesh): You book Jaipal Reddy under TADA.

प्रो० विजय कुमार मल्होत्रा (दिल्ली) : यह आफिसियल सिक्रेट नहीं रोक सकते तो इस्तीफा दें (व्यवधान)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: The OfTicia; Secrets Act is applicable to those take oath of secrecy. It is for the ■; rnent, because they have taken ;he oath, *(Jnterr/uptions)*

SYED FTBTEY RAZI (Uttar Pradesh): Madam, I stand on another point of crder. I agree with Mr. Jaipal Redely that he is quoting something end he is ready to lay ft on the Table of the House. But there is a certain laid down procedure about laying the docu-ents on the Table of the House. Before he seeks permission, it is to be ensured that violation of any Act is not there. The Chair has to *$ay* that he is permitted to lay it on the Table of the House. If the Chair permits, then he has io authenticate it. May be a notice has to be piven to the Minister concerned. Then he can lay it on the Table of the House. Just quoting from a document which is of a receipted nature, it is not proper. He is violating the proce-i dure which is already laid down in the Rules Book.

श्री एस० एस० अहलूवालिया : मैडम आपने जो रूलिंग दी, उसके बारे में मैं बताना चाहता हूं . . (व्यवधान)

उपसभापति : नहीं, एक मिनट ।

lust on$_e$ second, please. Syed Sibtey R\z\ Sahib you wanted to know whether I have allowed Mr. Jaipal Rcddy to lay the document on the Table of the House.

I would like to inform you that I have not yet permitted him to lay it on the ' Table of the House. He was reading from some document. I do not know what document it was. I do not have any access to the official document. So, I do not know what he is reading, from where he is reading. He said some document. If he is quoting something, it is entirely his responsibility. If he is quoting wrongly, then, he would be liable to be punished. He would be taken to task in accordance with the rules and procedure of the House. I havd no method, no way to find out from where he is reading or from where he would be reading... (Interruptions). . , Just a minute, please. Sit down.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: They have been punished ... *(Interruptions)* .. Please sjt down. Mr. Ahluwalia, let me tell you that there is a difference between stealing of

श्री एस.० एस० अहलुवालिया महोदया, आपने रूलिंग दी कि आफिसियल सीक्रेट एक्ट उसी पर लागू होता है, जिसने साफिशियल सीक्रेसी की शपथ ली हो। अभी कुछ दिन पहले "इसरो" में कुछ बईटिस्ट लोगों को गिरफ्तार किया गया। उन लोगों ने तो सीक्रेसी की कोई शपथ नहीं ली थी, किन्तु वहां से चोरी करके, दफ्तर से चोरी करके उन लोगों ने किया...(**व्यवधान**)..आप क्या करते हैं। कहते हैं कि आफिशियल सीकेट एक्ट। आप तो ये सदन में ला रहे हैं। कितनी चीजें बाहर जा रही हैं। इसका क्या प्रमाण है...(**व्यवधान**)

डा० मुरली मनोहर जोशी : (उत्तर प्रदेश) : यह उस विषय से संबंधित नहीं है, बिल्कुल..(**व्यवधान**)..

श्री एस०एस० अहलुवालिया : क्यों ?

ISRO's secret documents and selling them to foreign agencies and Mr. Jaipal Reddy bringing forward a document before the House. So, I cannot bring about a parity between the two. It is for Mr. Jaipal Reddy to take the responsibility in quoting.. .*(Interruptions)*... Mr. Jaipalji, there are two points of order. Let me hear them first ... *(Interruptions)*... Mr. Jagesh Desai, I will call you later.

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY (Pondicherry). Madam, you have rightly said that you have not allowed Mr. Jaipal Reddy to lay the document on the Table of the House. With due respect, I woud like to submit that, it is immaterial to us whether or not he is authenticating the document from which he is reading.

But T would like to know whether he can quote from a document which has not become the property of the House. ... *(Interruptions)* ... Kindly hear me. On the one side, you have not allowed him to lay the document on the Table of the House, on the other side he is quoting from the document. Therefore, .. .*(interruptions)*...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I will deaj with it. If there is peace in the House, confusion can be cleared. I would request every Member, to maintain peace because it is a sensitive issue. Let him raise his point of order. I will give my ruling, okay.

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: Therefore, Madam, that document has not become a property of the House; and you have not permitted Jiim to lay it on the Table of the House. He js reading verbatim from the document which should not go on record.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN; Jnst one minute. I would like to refer to the practice and Procedure of Parliament by Kaul and Shakdher. I would like *to* quote from page 870.

> "Members' right to quote from secret documents; A Member can ordinarily quote from a document that is treated by Government as secret or confidential, and which the Government have not disclosed in pubic interest. There is a possibility for such a document to be obtained through leakage or stealth or in an" irregular manner, and there is no compulsion on the Member to disclose the source

from which a copy thereof has been obtained by him." ...(Interruptions)...

अभी आप लोग बैठ जाइए । आप लोग का हे को झगड़ा कर रहे हैं ?

Why are you getting angry? I have read out from the Practice and Procedure of Parliament book. It is not my viewpoint So, there is no need for anybody to . •. (.Initerruptions)...

SHRI JAGESH DESAI: Madam, my point is very simple. (taterruptioos).

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: When he lays it on the Table, I will see the document- *{.Interruptions)'* One minute,

आप बहत ज्यादा डिस्टर्ब ©lease-

I must comment- *(Interruptions)*-One second- Listen- I cannot strain my throat more than I can- I have seen this- I am quoting from " Kaul and Shakdher" as to what the position is- Now, when he lays it on the Table of the House, it is my right and duty to look into the paper and let him authenticate it- That I would do- *(Interruptions)*- But he has a right to quote from there-

DR- MURLI MANOHAR JOSHI: Madam* I want to request you to permit Shri Jaipal Reddy to lay the papers on the Table-

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN. I will see the papers and then I will allow him* *(Interruptions)*-

SHRI JAGESH DESAI: Madam- • • *(Interruptions)*-

SHRI S JAIPAL REDDY: You must take some mercy- *(Interruptions)*-There is a limit to points of order also. I woudl request the Congress Members to take some mercy and impose some limit on themselves in regard to the points of order-SHRI JAGESH DESAI: Madam, in the'past also, Mr- Jaipal Reddy was allowed to table such documents after authentication- Before quoting from the document, he must authenticate it- He must take the responsibility for it and then table it.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr Jaipal Reddy, are you authenticating what you are reading? You are reading from some document that I have not seen- Whatever you read out, I allow you to read out. But i you are taking all the responsibility *(Interruptions)*- «

SHRI S- JAIPAL REDDY: Madam, it is entirely at my risk- I am rendering myself vulnerable to the proceedings of the House against me it my documents are proved wrong-

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: He has • authenticated if

SYED SIBTEY RAZI: Madam, my request is, there should be some limit- This is the Zero Hour- There is no discussion if there is one, then we should also get an opportunity to reply He is quoting- *(Interruptions)*- Is it free for all?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: 1 will allow you to reply-

SYED SIBTEY RAZI: You have permitted him to... *(Interruptions)'*

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I have not permitted- The Chairman has permitted him,

SYED SIBTEY RAZI: My submssion is this. The Chairman. has permitted it as a Zero Hour mention- There is some limit- For Zero Hour mentions, there are other speakers also- There are other items on the agenda- My request is that he should restrict himself to the timings- If they want a detailed discussion, we are ready for it- But let them not take the opportunity during the Zero Hour like this- *(Interruptions)*-

SHRI SIKANDER BAKHT: Madam, what are they doing? *(Interruptions)*-

SYED SIBTEY RAZI: During the Zero Hour, there is no question of reply. ... *{Interruptions).*

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr Jaipal Reddy, Mr- Sibtey Razi says, "Don't delay"- I do not want to delay I want to restrict it- I request *rou,* Mr- Jaipal Reddy Whatever you iave to say, be brief- *(Interruptions)*-fust one thing- One second- Mr aipal Reddy, you have started read-ng from documents which I have lot seen- You did not show it to he Chairman- If you have showed t, I have no idea about it- I do lot know- It should not be such a urprise to the Chair also because

have no way of saying to either ide of the House what document ou are quoting from-

SHRI S- IAIPAL REDDY: I have lid it clearly I am taking full res-onsibility I am exposing myself to

terrible risk- *(Interruptions)'*

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: But it

in fairness to the Chair also----------dich is also part of the procedure entioned in "Kaul and Shakdher" that the Chair should be informed i that if it is against somebody 10 cannot be here in this House..-*nterruptions)*....

SHRI S- IAIPAL REDDY: I am not iking any allegation- I am only vealing the truth- *(Interruptions)*-

CHE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Let me ish what I am saying- If anybody LO is not in the House, who cannot ne and answer... *(Interruptions)* there are matters which are relat-to some people who are authoris-and entitled to come before this mse, they should be present over :re so that they can give a reply-should not go by default- *(Inter-Ptions)*

SHRI S- IAIPAL REDDY: I am entirely accepting your position-

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Then why don't you show the papers to me?

SHRI S- JAIPAL REDDY: Madam, I am entitled to quote first and then authenticate- You know the position, Madam- Madam, I do not want to take much time of the House- Our other senior leaders are to speak in the matter- Madam, to restore the perspective of my original presentation, let me remind the House that the Food Ministry has recorded through the minutes.. .*(Interruptions)*

THE*fDEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Let the Food Minister come here- Let Mr- A- K" Antony be here *(Interruptions)* why not? *(Interruptions)*

SHRI S- JAIPAL REDDY: Madam, on 15-1293, the Food Ministry felt that there was no need for doing anything on the price front- As against this, as part of the minutes of the same meeting, the Ministry' of Civil Supplies, however, feared that there was a genuine risk that the lower opening stock, coupled with... *(Interruptions)*

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mi- Jaipal Reddy, I will have to stop you and I will have to quote from Kaul and Shakdher once again- I quote: "Normally, a Member is not expected, to spring a surprise on the Speaker of the House and the Government by quoting from a document which is not public- In fairness to all, and in accordance with the Parliamentary Conventions, he is expected to inform the Speaker and the Government in advance so that they are in a position to deal with the matter on the floor of the House where it is raised- If this requirement is not complied with, the Speaker mav stop the Mem-

ber from quoting such a document and ask him to make available to the Chair a copy before he can be allowed to proceed with any quotation thereafter" So, you please give it to me first- *{Interruptions)*

SHRI S- JAIPAL REDDY: Are you, in the meantime, stopping me, Madam?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Because I have to see that.

SHRI S- JAIPAL REDDY: Are you, in the meantime, stopping me? I don't mind being stopped-

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Let me at least have a look at it- You can show it to me-

, SHRI S- JAIPAL REDDY: Okay-' Now, I am not quoting- I am summarising- I am entitled to summarise-*(Interruptions)*

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I will see the record and see what should be quoted in the light of the papers which he will submit-

SHRI S- JAIPAL REDDY: No, I i have a right to summarise- Summarization is different from quotation. The Kaul and Shakdher does make a distinction- Madam, in the Cabinet Committee on Prices that met on 1512.93, the Civil Supplies Ministry pleaded that at least fifteen lakh tonnes must be imported-*(Interruptions)*

SHRI JAGESH DESAI: What is the date? ;

SHRI S- JAIPAL REDDY: 15.12.93 and the Civil Supplies Ministry contended, "Otherwise, the price -f sugar would go up to Rs- 20/- per kg-This document of the CCP minates was circulated to the Prime Minister's office, the Principal Secretary to the Prime.Minister and now we know that tlie Gian Prakash Committee indictf everybody except the Prime Minister- So, the Gian Prakash Committee's report is staje-managed and prefixed- Therefore, this report must be made public so that it can be condemned completely *T,* therefore, plead with the Government that this report be made public and laid on the Table of the House- I also request Mr. A. K. Antony to exercise his right to make a statement in the House following his resignation- So long as the Government does not apprise the House by laying the report on the Table of the House, we will not be in a mood to participate in the proceedings of the House-

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Shri Gnrudas Das Gupta- He has taken so much time- Mr- Gurudas Das Gupta, will you be a little brief? *(Interruptions)* Whatever be the reason*

SHRI GURUDAS **DAS** GUPTA (West Bengal): Madam, I express my deep SOJTOW and anguish at the exit of Mr. A. K. Antony I believe, a completely honest man had to leave because of the corrupt manipulations; an honest man had to leave because* of the corrupt manipulations ----- And the manipulation was done at the centre-stage of the citadel of power of the country-Madam, it is a great day of misfortune, misfortune because suspicion looms large on the Government, on the members of tie Government, on the country and this suspection if not dispelled, is going *to* affect our credibility at home and abroad- Therefore, the evil of secrecy has to be lifted, and if the evil of secrecy is to be lifted, the-e has to be transparency- The Government must share all its information, including the Report, with the Parliament to enable us to justify c'ther the action of Mr. Antony or the inaction of the Food Ministry o[r] the involvement or non-involvement of the PMO, PMO and also the officials who are working there- We want total

transparency- Without that, it is impossible for the Parliament, for the country to believe in the personal or collective credibility of those who are in power today Madam, then why has Mr- Antony resigned? He is a Member of this House- He is a part of this House- I will implore him to make a statement, telling us the factors that led to his resignation- I have been given to understand that he resigned in disgust and also as a protest against something which is going on- If it is true, il is only he who can clarify, then the situation is more dangerous than the resignation; Unfortunately, Madam, I believe that the resignation of Mr- Antony has not aroused the conscience of many of us, many of our friends who are still in the ruling party I wish, their conscience was aroused- There is a signal from Mr- Antony It is true that you do not believe in us- You always believe that we have been taking a political position, we have been doing) politicking- We have not been doing politicking- We have been only re-gistering our protest against an un-interrupted process of swindle that has been running across the country-It isi better that somebody, who is your colleague, has put in focus a central point, whether the people who have been identified as corrupt should be asked to go to restore the credibility which has been miserably lost, which has been lost and it has been proved that this has been lost.

I do not like to create any rancour. Therefore, Madam, the evil of secrecy must be removed and Parliament must be informed- It is not a normal situation- Therefore, you cannot play on the formality whether we are conforming to the conscience or not-It is an abnormal situation- And since it is an abnormal situation, there has to be a new term and the term demands that if you want to do well in future, if y^{ou} want to brighten your image in future—and you know what I am referring to—*i* it is necessary, it is essential that you come clean of this suspicion and, therefore, Madam, I demand publication of the Report, I demand a statement, I demand, first of all, an immediate action from the Prime Minister- He must ask his colleagues, who are corrupt, to resign or he must dismiss all the Ministers who have been found corrupt. Madam, the last point. I am echoing not my senti-ments, I am echoing not the sentiments of this side- I know many of you are speaking in the same language when you assemble in a meeting or when you go as a delegation to meet somebody else very important-Therefore, let us act together to save the declining national credibility It is our collective duty; otherwise, it will be impossible for your Government to function despite the Parliamentary majority that you might be still having today Thank you-

श्री जगदीश प्रसाद माथुर : (उत्तर प्रदेश) उपसभापति महोदया, अच्छा होता यदि श्री एन्टनी जी यहां होते। सबसे पहले मैं श्री एन्टनी को बधाई देना चाहता हूं कि उन्होंने एक अच्छी परम्परा का निर्वाह किया, लेकिन परोक्ष रूप में उन्होंने यह भी बता दिया है कि मेरे अतिरिक्त जितने लोगों के नाम उस रिपोर्ट में हैं, वे दोषी हैं। अब यह सरकार के ऊपर निर्भर करता है कि श्री एन्टनी की इस चुनौती का, जो उन्होंने प्रधान मंत्री के सारे मंत्री-मंडल पर खड़ी कर दी है, उसकी सफाई कैसे दें। इसलिए, महोदय, मेरी पहली मांग यह है कि प्रधान मंत्री जी को . . .

उपसभापति : आपका माइक नहीं चल रहा है।

श्री जगदीश प्रसाद माथुर : यह ऑन नहीं करते मैं क्या करूं। इसलिए, महोदया, मेरी पहली मांग है कि प्रधान मंत्री को स्वयं यहीं आकर स्थिति का स्पष्टीकरण करना चाहिए अन्यथा सारे देश में केन्द्र सरकार के ऊपर जो संकट उमड़ रहा है वह साफ नहीं होगा।

दूसरे, एन्टनी जी के अवाला अन्य कई मंत्री-मंडल के लोगों ने भी धमकी दी है कि

हम त्याग-पत्र देते हैं । यद्यपि उन्होंने सौजन्यता दिखाते हुए कहा है कि प्रधान मंत्री जी हम आपके हाथ मजबूत करने के लिए यह कर रहे हैं, लेकिन हाथ मजबूत करने के बहाने विनम्रता से कहा है कि आपने जो स्थिति बनाई हुई है उससे हम सहमत नहीं हैं, इसका मतलब यह है । इसलिए सबसे अधिक जिम्मेदारी प्रधान मंत्री जी की है।

अभी मेरे सहयोगी श्री जयपाल रेड्डी ने बहुत सी बात कही हैं, उनमें से एक प्रमुख बात की तरफ मैं ध्यान दिलाना चाहता हूं। उन्होंने कहा है कि सी० बी० पी० की रिपोर्ट सरवयुलेट की गई, प्राइम मिनिस्टर के आफिस को दी गई और रिपोर्ट पी० एम० ओ० को देने का मतलब पी० एम० को ही देना है । पी० एम० ओ० जो भी करता है, अच्छा या बुरा, उसकी सीधी जिम्मेदारी प्रधान मंत्री की है, उससे वह बच नहीं सकते। मुझे याद है कि यहां पर सदन में ही हमारे एक मंत्री महोदय ने अपने सैक्रेटरी के ऊपर आरोप लगाया था कि उसने बेइमानी की है। मेरे साथी ने बड़े विस्तार के साथ बताया है कि जो केबिनेट सैक्रेटरी थे, उन्होंने क्या-क्या किया है इस सारी स्थिति में एक ऐसा घपला पैदा हो गया है जिसमें ऐसा लगता है कि सरकार का अस्तित्व नहीं है। जब तक सरकार का अस्तित्व स्थापित नहीं होता तब तक इस सदन की कार्यवाही चलाना बेकार है। इसलिए मैं समझता हूं कि इससे पहले कि सदन की कार्यवाही चले, इसका स्पष्टीकरण हो जाना चाहिए।

अंतिम बात मैं कहना चाहता हूं कि एक और संकट नजर आ रहा है। यद्यपि यह कांग्रेस का मामला होगा, लेकिन चूंकि कांग्रेस सरकार में है इसलिए मामला देश का भी बनता है। प्रधान मंत्री के बहुत से मित्र भी हैं, बहुत से विरोधी भी हैं, लेकिन आज विरोधियों का पलड़ा भारी हो रहा है। तो लगता है कि शायद वे पार्टी के अंदर या सरकार के अंदर क्योंकि जो सरकार के अंदर बैठे हुए कैबिनेट के मंत्री हैं वे पार्टी के नेता भी हैं, हो सकता है कि वे प्रधान मंत्री को मजबूर कर दें रिजाइन करने के लिए। तो मेरा आग्रह है कि बजाए इसके कि री-शफल किया जाए, प्रधान मंत्री को इस्तीफा देना चाहिए और इस्तीफा देने से पहले स्थिति स्पष्ट करनी चाहिए ।

उपसभापति : अभी कितनी देर और बोलेंगी?

श्री जगदीश प्रसाद माथुर : सौकिडली, मैं अपने मित्र श्री एन्टनी जी से कहना चाहूंगा कि वे अपने इस अधिकार का उपयोग करें कि उन्होंने इस्तीफा क्यों दिया है, लेकिन इससे पहले वे आकर यहां बताएं कि उन्होंने इस्तीफा दिया है। क्योंकि अखबारों में छपा है, आप कह देंगे कि अखबारों की बात तो गलत होती है । तो अखबारों के अनुसार, क्योंकि उन्होंने खंडन नहीं किया है, उन्होंने इस्तीफा दिया है, लेकिन वे आकर यहां बता दें । भले मानस, आपने इतना बड़ा उदाहरण रखा है देश के सामने, आप आकर कहिए गर्व के साथ कि हां, मैंने त्याग पत्र दिया है। यह मैं उनसे अपील करता हूं ।

अंत में मैं कहना चाहता हूं कि मेरी दो मांगें हैं, एक एन्टनी जी से और दूसरी मांग है प्रधान मंत्री जी से । कहा जाता था उस समय भी, आज भी गलियारे में कुछ मंत्री कहते फिर रहे हैं। हमें क्यों कहते हो, प्रधान मंत्री से कहो न ? गलियारे में कह रहे हैं, मुझसे कह रहे हैं, मुझसे कहा एक मंत्री जी ने। मुझे क्यों पकड़ते हो, पकड़ो प्रधान मंत्री को। तो प्रधान मंत्री को हम पकड़ना चाहते हैं, he should be present here to reply. (*Interruptions*)...

SYED SIBTEY RAZI: It is a public speech. (*Interruptions*)...It is wrong. (*Interruptions*)...He has no right to ask like this. (*Interruptions*)...

श्री जनार्दन यादव : (बिहार) : प्रधान मंत्री को त्याग-पत्र देने के लिए कहिए।

श्री जनेश्वर मिश्र (उत्तर प्रदेश) : उपसभापति महोदया, यह बहुत ही दुःखद स्थिति है कि सरकार के एक मंत्री ने इस्तीफा दिया है और इस बात पर शिकायत करते हुए दिया कि एक दूसरे मंत्री ने बगल के सदन में बयान दिया जिसमें कि खाद्य मंत्रालय को इस बात की जवाबदेही दी कि वह प्रधानमंत्री कार्यालय को समय पर सूचना नहीं दिया करते थे। तो ये मंत्रालय बनाम मंत्रालय का मामला हो गया। कई बार तो इस सरकार ने यह कोशिश की है

के कोई बड़ा घपले का केस आया तो किसी एक मंत्री से इस्तीफा दिलवा दिया बात को टालने के लिए । अब की बार कहा जा रहा है कि मंत्री ने खुद इस्तीफा दिया है। उनसे कहा जा रहा है कि अपना इस्तीफा वापस ले लो और वह इस्तीफा वापस लेने को तैयार नहीं हो रहे हैं । संकट यह आ गया है कि इस संसदीय जनतंत्र में जहां बहुमत की पार्टी सरकार चलाती है और वह देश की सरकार कही जाती है, उस इमारत की एक ईंट खिसक गई है और इमारत कभी भी गिर सकती है। तो लोकसभा और राज्य सभा में लोगों में घबराहट है कि इस गिरने वाली इमारत के बारे में कहीं न कहीं गंभीरता से सोचना चाहिए।

महोदया, पिछले 3-4 महीनों से इस पर झंझट हो रहा है, चीनी के सवाल पर झंझट हो रहा है। जब कल्पनाथ राय जी उस विभाग के मंत्री थे तो विपक्ष की तरफ से उनको बोलने नहीं दिया जा रहा था। उस समय जिस तरह के नारे विपक्ष की तरफ से कल्पनाथ राय के खिलाफ लगते थे और एक बार जब कल्पनाथ राय जी ने जवाब देने से बचना चाहा शेरो-शायरी पढ़कर तो आपने भी उनको झिड़का था। हमारा ख्याल था कि उसी समय अगर प्रधानमंत्री जी कल्पनाथ राय जी को अपनी सरकार से बरखास्त कर देते तो इतनी दूर तक बात बिगड़कर नहीं जाती।

महोदय, हम जानते हैं कि ये कांग्रेस पार्टी नेहरु की पार्टी है। जवाहरलाल नेहरू के जमाने में भी भ्रष्टाचार के घपलों के मामले आते थे। मूंदड़ा कांड आया था। एक जज की हंक्वारी बिठाई गई थी और उसके बाद बहुत काबिल मंत्री थे अपने वक्त के टी०टी० कृष्णामाचारी साहब, नेहरू जी ने धीरे से उसका इस्तीफा ले लिया था, जनता को दिखाने के लिए, सार्वजनिक जीवन में स्वच्छता लाने के लिए । आप जवाहरलाल नेहरू की पार्टी अपने को कहते हो तो आपका इसे याद रखना चाहिए । आपने केशव देव मालवीय साहब सिराजुद्दीन कांड में फंसे थे। बहुत मामूली रकम का आरोप उन पर लगा था और उनका इस्तीफा ले लिया गया था। कांग्रेस पार्टी के राज में इंदिरा जी के जमाने से जब ये घपले आए, खास तौर पर से ललित नारायण मिश्र के खिलाफ लाइसेंस घपला कांड, तब से लीपापोती की कोशिश की जाने लगी। बोफोर्स का केस आया, तब भी लीपापोती की गई। उसके नतीजे आप जानते हैं। इधर एक के बाद एक कई घपले सामने आए हैं। संयुक्त संसदीय समिति बैठी है. . . (**व्यवधान**) . .

श्री सुरिन्दर कुमार सिंगला (पंजाब) : वी०पी० सिंह सरकार के घपले भी बता दो।

श्री जनेश्वर मिश्र : इन्होंने यह पूछा है कि वी०पी०सिंह सरकार के घपले बता दो। घपले और घोटाले सारे देश में जिनका बाजा बजता है, इत्फाक से किसी भी विरोधी पार्टी की सरकार जब दिल्ली में बनी है तो सारे देश में बाजा बजने वाला कोई घपला आया नहीं है । वह आप लोगों के जमाने में ही आया है ।

महोदया, मैं जान-बूझकर गिना रहा हूं– मूंदड़ा कांड, लाइसेंस घोटाला कांड, बोफोर्स कांड और अभी-अभी जो आया है शेयर घोटाला कांड और उसके बाद चीनी घोटाला कांड। ये घपले और घोटाले आप लोगों को ही मुबारक हुए हैं । वी० पी० सिंह, मोरारजी देसाई, चरण सिंह और चंद्रशेखर जी का नाम लेकर हम लोगों को दोष मत दीजिए । ये दोष हम लोगों पर लगा नहीं है, लगा हो तो बता दीजिए। इसके लिए कानून बन जाना चाहिए । अभी लोकपाल विधेयक पर बात हो रही थी। सार्वजनिक जीवन में जो भी लोग हैं, मंत्री बने चाहे कुछ भी बने, मंत्री बनने के पहले उनकी जितनी हैसियत होती है और मंत्री बनने के बाद जितनी हैसियत हो गई है, चाहे वह प्रधानमंत्री हो या कोई और हो, कोई एक निष्पक्ष कमेटी बना दी जाए और वह जो भी हैसियत बढी हो उसको चुपचाप जब्त कर ले, कोई कार्यवाही न की जाए तो भी हैसियत नहीं बढा करेगी लेकिन इस तरह का कोई कानून नहीं है । खाद्य मंत्री हम लोगों के पड़ोसी हैं। जो पहले खाद्य मंत्री थे ।

श्री जयपाल रेड्डी : जब भी हैं, वो कहां जा रहे हैं ? . . . (**व्यवधान**) . . .

श्री जनेश्वर मिश्र : खाद्य मंत्री की माली हैसियत की जानकारी हम लोगों को है। जब वह पढते थे तब वह हमारी समाजवादी युवजन

सभा के मेम्बर थे और इस समय जो उनकी हैसियत है, वह भी हम जानते हैं। हमने जान-बूझ कर कहा है कि जो कुछ भी हैसियत हम लोगों की सरकार में जाने के बाद बढ़ी हो, चव्हाण साहब बैठे हैं, कोई भी कानून बनाएं हम उसका स्वागत करेंगे। सरकार उस पूरी की पूरी बढ़ी हुई हैसियत को जब्त कर ले और ये सार्वजनिक जीवन में सफाई लाने के लिए जरूरी है। तब देखा जाएगा कि वह वी० पी० सिंह की सरकार के मंत्रियों की हैसियत बढ़ी या जवाहर लाल जी से लेकर राजीव गांधी होते हुए नरसिम्हा राव की सरकार के लोगों की बढ़ी? कांग्रेस पार्टी के कुछ मित्रों ने आज लॉबी में कहा कि बहुत ही ईमानदार मंत्री ने इस्तीफा दिया है।

उपसभापति : लॉबी की बातें यहां क्यों कर रहे हैं?

श्री संघ प्रिय गौतम : (उत्तर प्रदेश) : वह सत्य है। ... **(व्यवधान)** ...

श्री जनेश्वर मिश्र : विपक्ष ने यहां कहा, प्रश्न-काल के दौरान भी कहा और कई बार इस तरह की टिप्पणी की कि एक अकेला ही ईमानदार मंत्री था, उसने इस्तीफा दिया है। बाकी मंत्री लोगों को इस पर गुरेज हुआ होगा कि हम लोगों को ये बेईमान कह रहे हैं अप्रत्यक्ष रूप से लेकिन ये टिप्पणी जनतंत्र में चलती रहती है। सरकार में बैठे हुए लोगों को यह टिप्पणी झेलनी चाहिए, इतना मैं निवेदन करूंगा। मैं यहां पर बहुत सफाई के साथ कहना चाहता हूं कि जिन दिनों ज्ञान प्रकाश जी की कमेटी की घोषणा हुई थी तब भी विपक्ष के लोगों ने आरोप लगाया था कि ज्ञान प्रकाश जी रिटायर हो गए हैं। कई तरह के संबंध इनके चीनी घरानों से, शुगर घरानों से हैं। ये जो कुछ भी रिपोर्ट देंगे, वह पवित्र रिपोर्ट नहीं मानी जाएगी लेकिन ये बहस केवल इतनी ही नहीं है। जिन दिनों हल्ला बहुत मचा था, कल्पनाथ राय ने मुलायम सिंह की सरकार पर एक आरोप लगाया था। उत्तर प्रदेश सरकार पर एक आरोप लगाया था कि उत्तर प्रदेश और कई राज्यों की सरकारों ने चूंकि गन्ने के दाम बढ़ा दिए इसलिए चीनी महंगी हो गई, बाजार में कारखानों में खांडसारी पैदा करने के लिए उन्होंने आदेश जारी कर दिया, स्वतंत्र छूट दे दी इसलिए चीनी के कारखानों में गन्ना नहीं गया, इस तरह का कारण बताया था। जो मैं जानता हूं वह सोच की लड़ाई है। एक तरफ गन्ना उत्पादक हैं और दूसरी तरफ चीनी उत्पादक हैं, इन दोनों के बीच में टकराव होता रहता है। शुगर लॉबी सरकार पर दबाव डालती रहती है कि गन्ना उत्पादक को बहुत फायदा न होने पाए और जो किसानों के पक्षधर होते हैं, वे गन्ना उत्पादक का पक्ष लेते हैं। यह लड़ाई तो चलती रहेगी अनन्त काल तक लेकिन ये गांधी की भी तो पार्टी है, गांधी का भी तो देश है। केवल नेहरू की पार्टी नहीं है। हमने अपनी पार्टी में भी यह राय रखी थी कि चीनी कोई ऐसी जरूरी चीज तो नहीं थी कि अगर कम पैदा हुई तो इसको खाए बिना आदमी मर जाता। इस समय हालांकि देश में... **(व्यवधान)** ...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: There are many other Members to speak.

श्री जनेश्वर मिश्र : मैडम खत्म कर रहा हूं। देश में इतना बड़ा नेता किसी भी पार्टी में कोई नहीं कि राष्ट्र के नाम संदेश देता लेकिन अगर चीनी कम पैदा हो गई तो दिल्ली की सबसे बड़ी कुर्सी पर बैठा हुआ आदमी चाहे उतना बड़ा नेता न हो जितने बड़े नेहरू थे, जितने बड़े जय प्रकाश, गांधी या लोहिया थे। छोटा ही नेता सही, यह तो कह सकता था कि चीनी कम हुई है, देश के लोगों, हफ्ते में दो दिनों के लिए चीनी मत खाओ, खांडसारी का इस्तेमाल मत करो। विदेशी पूंजी का सवाल फंसेगा, कर्जा बचेगा अगर किफायतसारी का सिद्धांत देश के सामने अपील के तौर पर दिया गया होता तो रास्ता निकलता लेकिन देशी पूंजीपतियों से जो चीनी पैदा करते हैं और विदेशी पूंजीपति जो चीनी सप्लाई करते हैं, दोनों से पैसा लेने का सवाल था इसलिए गांधी का रास्ता किसी भी राजनीतिक पार्टी को रास नहीं आया और देश भ्रष्टाचार के रास्ते चला गया। आज भी मैं मांग करूंगा कि जिस मंत्री ने इस्तीफा दिया है उस माननीय मंत्री को चूंकि इस सदन के सदस्य हैं, उनको आप बुलायें। अखबारों में नाम छप रहा है, हम लोगों के मित्र हैं, यहां बैठते हैं, वे पीड़ा में हैं। हम लोग उनकी पीड़ा को समझें। उनका वक्तव्य

सुनें कि वे क्यों ऐसी हालत पैदा कर रहे हैं? यह घर की बात है, सदन की बात है कि हम बुला करके उनका वक्तव्य सुनें। इसमें राजनीतिक पार्टी चाहे वह सरकारी हों या विरोधी हो, इसमें पक्ष लेने का सवाल नहीं है, उनका वक्तव्य सुनना चाहिए। सरकारी पार्टी को भी इजाजत देनी चाहिए कि वे आकर वक्तव्य दें।

उपसभापति : जनेश्वर जी, दूसरे लोग भी हैं।

श्री जनेश्वर मिश्र : एक मिनट में खत्म कर रहा हूं मैडम। एक निवेदन तो हमारा यह होगा और दूसरा निवेदन यह होगा कि इस पूरे चीनी घोटाले में ज्ञान प्रकाश कमेटी की रिपोर्ट के मुताबिक या बिना रिपोर्ट के जो कोई भी दोषी पाए जावें उनको तत्काल सरकार से बरखास्त किया जाना चाहिए। चाहे वे कल्पनाथ राय हों, चाहे नरसिंह राव हों, किसी भी राय से मुझे कोई मतलब नहीं है। जो दोषी पाया जाए, उसको तत्काल बरखास्त किया जाए, वरना देश में यह संदेश जा रहा है कि बड़ी कुर्सी पर बैठा हुआ आदमी अगर चोरी कर रहा है तो पुलिस का सिपाही क्यों नहीं कर सकता, छोटा दुकानदार क्यों नहीं कर सकता? संपूर्ण समाज भ्रष्टाचार में जाना चाहता है, उसको रोकने के लिए सदन में कोई कारगर कदम उठाया जाना चाहिए।

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Now, Dr. Biplab Dasgupta Mr. Dasgupta, now I think you will have to be brief because 1 have got three more names

DR- BIPLAB DASGUPTA (West Bengal): Madam, I will be very brief- Madam, I fully share the sentiments of the other leaders of the Opposition and I demand that the Minister who has resigned, Mr. Antony, should come to this House and explain to us the reasons for his resignation- In the last Session when we discussed the sugar issue, many of us demanded the resignation of a Minister, a Minister who is responsible for the sugar scandal- Today we are hearing the resignation of a Minister, who is always respected, who is known to us very well and who leads his life with honesty, integrity and honour- He resigned for a wrong reason because it is this Minister, Mr Antony, who pointed out to the Government in December, 1993 that unless we imported sugar, there might be sugar shortage and the price might go up to Rs. 20/- a kilogram. The Minister whose resignation we sought is not even [present in this House- He is a Member of this House and he knows that we will be discussing this issue in the House- He has cared not to come. We demand that he should come to the House and the honourable course open to him is to resign from his post-Yesterday when Mr- Shukla was speaking, he said that the Committee's report could not be presented before the House but he assured a gist of the report would be made known- And the gist came in the form of a reply to an Unstarred Question which was also discussed in this House yesterday. My own feeling is —I want to mention something which is mentioned in another context but is also important here—that what the gist reveals is very interesting. But what it conceals is vital. We should continue to insist on the submission of the report- Despite reservations about the way the Enquiry Committee was appointed, we want this report to come before the House-There is another reason which is also very, very important' Now it is true that the Ministers of the Congress party are known for corruption-But when you go before the people, what do they say? They say that all politicians are corrupt- They genera-i Use and say that all are corrupt- Corruption is .starting from the high places- Unfortunately, for those of us

who want to maintain honour and dignity in public life could not do so-Our image is also tarnished because of a few corrupt individuals- They tarnished the image of not only themselves and the party to which they belong but also the image of all politicians- For diis reason- I would suggest to all Members of this House, cutting across party lines, that we will have to conform to some moral ethics, some principles and every one who is in public life must take a pledge that he will not depart from these ethics- There should be some conventions for all parties and whoever violates those conventions should be thrown out of the political party to which he belongs- After the recent election, the leaders of the Congress party should have read the writings on the wall- With this rebuttal of the Congress party in Karnata-ka, *it* has been easier for us... *(.Interruptions)* ...

SHRI S- JAIPAL REDDY: Madam, the Leader of the House is going away

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: The Leader of the House has taken my permission- He has a meeting in Lok Sabha with various leaders of the Opposition- Mr- Shukla is also there- He took my permission to go to Lok Sabha-

SHRI S- JAIPAL REDDY: We are also going there-

DR' BIPLAB DASGUPTA: We are

all going there-SHRI *Sr* TAIPAL

REDDY: He can at

least tell the House and go-

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: He told the Chair- He does not need to tell the House.*"(Interruptions)*-

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: Madam, we are also **going***

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr Chavan is not a person who will run away from his responsibility He is die Leader of the House-SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: We have never said that he is running away from die House- What we are saying is that he should be here till we complete- He has to answer if

DR. BIPLAB DASGUPTA:. Now he is sitting- Thank you very much for sitting- We should not simply take it as a party or political issue- It is an issue which concerns all of us-I appeal to the conscience of all Congress members to please come forward *-(Interruptions)*- some of those who have conscience and also fight within the party, to ensure that such things do not continue because it is not only a question of protecting an individual or a Government but it is a question of protecting the political life, *the* political structure, and the democracy in die country-With this appeal I thank you and I insist that the Minister comes and makes a statement-

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: The names are written before me- Even a fraction of a second is the same as violating the procedure for half-a-minute or one minute-

श्री सिकन्दर बख्त : मेरा कहना यह है कि गवर्नमेंट का वजूद नहीं है। एक मिनिस्टर इल्जाम लगाते हैं कि प्राइम मिनिस्टर को डार्क में रखा गया है और जिस मिनिस्टर पर इल्जाम लगता है वह कहते हैं कि हर मौके पर उन्हें खबर दी गई । यह गवर्नमेंट है कहां। मेरी गुजारिश यह है कि इस गवर्नमेंट को रिजाइन करना चाहिए।

شری سکندر بخت: میرا کہنا یہ ہے کہ گورنمنٹ کا وجود نہیں ہے۔ ایک منسٹر الزام لگاتے ہیں کہ پرائم منسٹر کو ڈارک میں رکھا گیا ہے اور جس منسٹر پر الزام لگتا ہے وہ کہتے ہیں کہ ہر موقع پر انہیں خبر دی گئی۔ یہ گورنمنٹ ہے کہاں۔ میری گزارش یہ ہے کہ اس گورنمنٹ کو ریزائن کرنا چاہیئے۔

They don't exist. They don't have any business to be there.

श्री सत्य प्रकाश मालवीय (Uttar Pradesh): इनको तो परमिशन नहीं दी थी।

उपसभापति : हमारे गण्य मान्य सदस्य हैं इसलिए बोल रहे हैं।

श्री सत्य प्रकाश मालवीय : आज के अतारांकित प्रश्न संख्या 1311 में जो डा० मुरली मनोहर जोशी एवं अन्य सदस्यों द्वारा रखा गया है इसमें कुछ बातें श्री एन्टनी के विभाग के संबंध में भी कही गई हैं। श्री एन्टनी ने कहा कि यह गलत है, असत्य है। इसका कोई आधार नहीं है। यह जो ज्ञान प्रकाश रिपोर्ट के संबंध में है मैं पढ़ता हूं: "Certain lapses have also been identified on account of lack of clarity in the decisions of the Cabinet Committee on Prices regarding import of sugar, the adoption of a narrow departmental approach on the part of the various concerned Ministries, the fact that the Cabinet Committee on Prices, the Food Minister, the Civil Supplies Minister i.e. Mr. A. K. Antony and the Cabinet Secretary did not bring the matter to the notice of the Cabinet/Prime Minister" श्री एन्टनी ने त्याग पत्र दे दिया यह कहते हुए कि इसमें उनके विभाग के संबंध में जो टिप्पणी की गई है वह निराधार है, असत्य है क्योंकि उनके मंत्रालय ने बराबर सरकार का, केबिनेट का ध्यान आकर्षित कराया है चीनी की कमी की ओर। जब ज्ञान प्रकाश कमेटी की नियुक्ति की गई 17 जुलाई, 1994 को उस वक्त यह तय हुआ था कि ज्ञान प्रकाश अपनी रिपोर्ट प्रधान मंत्री के पास देंगे। मैं उसको पढ़ना चाहूंगा : "It has been decided to conduct a preliminary administrative inquiry to ascertain facts and fix *prima facie* responsibility for lapses, if any, in dealing with the situation arising out of shortage in availability of sugar in the current sugar season. The Gian Prakash Committee would submit its report to the Prime Minister within one month's time." इसके अलावा इसमें प्रधान मंत्री कार्यालय पर कुछ आरोप हैं। प्रधान मंत्री कार्यालय में 31 जुलाई, 1994 की स्थिति के हिसाब से 78 गजेटेड आफिसर्स, 407 नान गजेटेड आफिसर्स मिलाकर कुल संख्या 485 है। इसके अतिरिक्त प्राइम मिनिस्टर हैं और भुवनेश चतुर्वेदी हैं जिनका यह उत्तर है। मेरा निवेदन यह है क्योंकि ज्ञान प्रकाश कमेटी की रिपोर्ट प्रधान मंत्री जी के पास दी गई है इसलिए प्रधान मंत्री जी सदन के सामने आयें और सदन के सामने आकर ज्ञान प्रकाश कमेटी की जो संस्तुतियां हैं उनको सदन के समक्ष रखें। श्री एंटनी ने अपने त्याग पत्र में इस बात को बराबर कहा है कि उन्होंने किन कारणों से त्याग पत्र दिया है। यह उनकी बहादुरी है। वह निहायत स्वच्छ और ईमानदार मंत्री हैं। लोकतांत्रिक प्रणाली को सुदृढ़ करने के लिए, सार्वजनिक जीवन को सुदृढ़ करने के लिए श्री एन्टनी ने त्याग पत्र दिया है। इसलिए वह बधाई के पात्र हैं। मेरी दो मांगें हैं। एक तो प्रधान

†[] Transliteration the Arabic Script.

मंत्री को सदन में आना चाहिए क्योंकि वह रिपोर्ट उनके पास है और उस रिपोर्ट के संबंध में सदन को जानकारी करानी चाहिए । दूसरा, श्री एन्टनी से मेरा आपके माध्यम से निवेदन है–यह उनका अधिकार है हम उनको बाध्य नहीं कर सकते, लेकिन चूंकि सारा देश एन्टोनी जी की बात को सूनना चाहता है, इसलिए श्री एन्टोनी को सदन में आना चाहिए और अपने त्यागपत्र के कारणों के बारे में इस सदन के माध्यम से सारे देश को इसकी जानकारी देनी चाहिए।

तीसरा, अगर प्रधान मंत्री इस विषय में स्पष्टीकरण के लिए सदन में नहीं आते तो सदन में कोई भी कार्यवाही नहीं होनी चाहिए । कम से कम हम लोग उसमें सहयोग नहीं करेंगे,

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Shri Murasoli Mararv

श्री संघ प्रिय गौतम : उपसभापति महोदया :

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No, no. Please... Nothing will go on record.

श्री संघ प्रिय गौतम :*

SHRI MOHAMMAD AFZAL *alias* MEEM AFZAL: What is this?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: The matter is that issues are important-If you feel, go to the Chairman and take the permission- You should talk to your leader- Why are you speaking without my permission?

SHRI MURASOLI MARAN: Ma dam, an extraordinary situation has arisen.....

SHRI MOHAMMAD AFZAL *alias* MEEM AFZAL: Nobody is allowed to speak.

♦**Not** recorded.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: What do you mean by "nobody is allowed to speak"? Should not I allow the people to speak who took permission from the Chair? Take permis- sion from the Chair and I will allow you accordingly. But I cannot allow any interruption.

SHRI MOHAMMAD AFZAL *alias* MEEM AFZAL: I have sought your permission. I am also a member. There are 245 Members...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You do not have my permission and I have no papers regarding your submission on my table. You should keep quiet. Never mind- Do not interrupt. Nothing will go on record.

SHRI MURASOLI MARAN (Tamil Nadu): Madam, an extraordinary situation has arisen because of the resignation of Mr Antony from the Cabinet. We all know that Mj Antony is an honourable man. What has happened is that not only the biggest fraud in the history of India has taken place, but there is also the question of transparency and accountability of a democratic Government. Madam, really what has happened? Artificially sugar price has been increased from March 1993 engineered by the multi-national cartels aided by their Indian collaborators and some Ministers in the Cabinet. This is the problem. Artificially they have raised the price to squeeze the common man. Mr. Jaipal Reddy was good enough to narrate from *a* note of the Cabinet Committee on Prices. I also would narrate a little more.

SOME HON. MEMBER: Are you quoting?

SHRI MURASOLI MARAN: No I am not quoting.

The crisis started in 1993. Mr* A- C-Sen, the Food Secretary warned .of a

shortfall in production in November 1993 and prepared a draft note for the import of one million tonnes of sugar on PDs account. Mr- Kalp Nath Rai sat on the note for two weeks. He did not do anything. Later, the Food Minister Mr. Kalp Nath Rai ordered for a new note persuading the Secretary to write a new note calling for a very short amount of sugar to be imported. It is a fictitious note. This fictitious note was also appended to the original note. The revised note was discussed in the Cabinet Committee on Prices meeting on December 15, 1993 about which Shri Jaipal Reddy quoted. What hap-pened that day? Madam, here, I ami having an article which I read- "To those present at the meeting of 15th December 1993, Mr. Rai was quoted as saying that the import of sugar which should have prevented the anticipated rise in prices would only be made over his dead body" That was his assertion! That was his assertism before the Cabinet Committee on Prices. So, it is very clear as to who is guilty. He was so stubbornly opposed to anti-people policy. It is not the complicity of the parties alone, but it is also the complicity of the multinationals with their Indian collaborators. Some of the Ministers are involved.

The Prime Minister appointed the Gian Prakash Committee. Madam, Gian Prakash has no *locus standi* to so into this matter. Yesterday, Shri Jaipal Reddyji said that, because Mr. Gian Prakash is the Chairman of the Parsurampuria Synthetics, a conglomerate that added sugar to his interests, but it was granted a licence only last month. So Gian Prakash was an interested man. Even that interested person could not hide all the facts. Now, naturally, the question is not about Kalp Nath Rai only-What is the role of the Prime Minister? That is what every citizen of this country is asking. All documents germane to the crisis had, at one point of time or the other, been brought to the attention of the Prime Minister- The decision to import sugar was his own. So, this is a cloud hanging over the Prime Minister and the Cabinet-

Therefore, I would request that the Gian Prakash Committee Report should be submitted to the Parliament so that we can discuss it and the guilty are punished and not the innocent people like Mr. Antony. Shri Antony had ordered for the import of one million tonnes of sugar earlier; so he is not guilty. I have been told that there was a Congress Parliamentary Party meeting and the Prime Minister is reported to have told that Shri Antony has resigned. What does it mean? Tt means that the wrong person has resigned and the guilty person is still continuing in the Cabinet and the Prime Minister is protecting him. Therefore, I would plead with you to take a serious action.

SHRI V. GOAPALSAMY (Tamil Nadu): Madam, only an emotional speech of Antony before that Roman masses after the assassination of Julius Ceaser in the Senate changed the history of Rome. Today, one action of Mr. A. K. Antony, a man of honesty and integrity, has struck a mortal blow to the credibility of the Congress Government headed by Mr-Narasimha Rao. After the verdict piven by the people of Karnataka and Anrlbra Pradesh, the Government has "drier! another feather to its cap of corruption. Skeletons after skeletons are coming out of the cupboard of fhe Government of Mr. Narasimha Rao. They'have made a hat-tirck in the play-ground. The first goal was Bofors, then the Securities scam and now the sugar scandal. The Government is answerable to the Parlia-

inent, it is accountable to the Par liament, and the Parliament is ac countable to the people, who are the real masters of this country. But I accuse this Government- I raise my accusing finger against this Govern ment. Madam, the Government is guilty and the Prime Minister is pro tecting and shielding the * in the Cabinet. This Government has not come forward to inform the Parlia ment. What has prevented you fromi presenting the Gian Prakash Com mittee Report before the Parliament? But you can suppress such reports. You can suppress the CBI report, when the CBI, it is reliably learnt, indicted some of the Ministers in the securities scam. And the CBI was dictated to bury the report. You can suppress such faets, but you can not suppress the anger of the people- You cannot suppress the anger of the people. The people have expressed their tremendous anger in the ballot box which is very powerful. The ballot is more powerful than the bul let. Mr. Antony is honest. He has set the ball in motion. My friend was speaking about conscience. There was one man, Mr. Arun Singh who expressed his conscience on the floor of the House after resigning his post on the Bofors issue. Now Mr. Antony has set the ball in motion- Now ** because they have played with the lives of the common people and deliberately and wantonly they did not import sugar when the price in the international market was very low. The sole purpose was to enrich the sugar lobby. They have got the dividends. The coffers of some of the Ministers have been full with the money from the sugar lobby. The result is, the economic "backbone of the common man has been broken with the price rise. You have committed a fraud. This Government which is run by Mr. Nara-simha Rao alon? with his colleagues some" of whom are corrupt, have committed a fraud against the people- Therefore, Madam, it is high time that Mr Antony should come before the House and he should make a statement- Not only that-Mr Narasimha Rao should take the responsibility- He is responsible for everything- *(Time-Bell)* Therefore, I would demand that Mr- Narasimha Rao, if he has got conscience, should step down- First of all, I demand the sacking of MrKalp Nath Rai- He should be removed from the Cabinet-Otherwise, the people are ready-Your days are numbered- You will be the last Congress Prime Minister here, and you are losing your ground- The people have lost confi-dence in you- There are some people who have got the conscience because Mr-Antony has stated, "I did not consult anybody I consulted my conscieence, and then I acted upon" You pressurised the people- I know what is going on there. You are singing your own tune- The Party is singing its own tune- You are pressurising your people- There are some honest people in the treasury benches- You pressurise those people to throw out the. corrupt Ministers** **otherwise, the credibility which is at its lowest ebb will be totally destroyed- It is already totally destroyed-*(Time-Bell)* Therefore, Madam, I take my hats off to Mr- Antony And I demand that Mr- Kalp Nath Rai should be removed, and the Government should come with a statement-The report should be presented before this House for a debate. Mr-Antony also should be given a (chance to come over here to make a statement-

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I have some more names...

SHRI G. SWAMINATHAN : Madam, T am on a point of information. I reliably learnt that Mr. Kalp Nath Rai has resigned. Is it true? I want to know.

**Exprtnged as ordered by the Chair

**Expunged as ordered by the Chair-

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I do not know.

SHRI G. SWAM1NATHAN : I reliably learnt.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: From where did you hear?

SHRI G. SWAMINATHAN : I relia[J] bly learnt that he has resigned.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I have no information. When I am informed, I will let you know.

SHRI G. SWAMINATHAN: You please ask the Government. The Minister is there. We are very much concerned, Madam, about his resignation.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Mr. Swaminathan, I have no such information. When the information come[s] to me. I will tell you.

Now, let [mt] make an announcement. All those people who have given their names to the Chairman, that list has exhausted. There ^re some other people who have requested. Three or four names are still there. We are going to adjourn for lunch within one minute. But there is some clarification which the Home Minister wants to make as regards Ma-nipur.

PROCLAMATION UNDER ARTICLE 356 OF THE CONSTITUTION IN RELATION TO MANIPUR— CONTD.

THE MINISTER OF HOME AFFAIRS (SHRI S. B. CHAVAN): Madam, this is in regard to the laying of the paper on Manipur on the Table of the House. My colleague, Shri Rahi, was specially requested by me to lay the paper on the Table of the House-I was in an important meeting and that is why I could not be present. I am really sorry for the same-

The point was raised by some hon. Members that while revoking the President's Rule, it required the approval of both the Houses. Actually, I have gone through all the papers. In fact, there is no such requirement at all. Before the revocation, the Governor has to recommend to the Central Government and the Cabinet has to take the decision. The Cabinet took the decision. Thereafter, it was sent to the President. The Pre? sident having accepted the proposals now, the President's Rule has been, revoked in that area.

The only point which was made was, since the House was in Session, the House should have been informed. That is exactly what we are doing, Madam. *(Interruptions)*.

श्री जगदीश प्रसाद माथुर (उत्तर प्रदेश): महोदया, एक मिनट . . . (व्यवधान)

उपसभापति : उस पर डिसकशन नहीं होगा, उन्होंने एक्सप्लेनेशन दे दिया है, माथर साहब ।

SHRI JAGDISH PRASAD MATHUR: No.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: The House is adjourned till 2.30 p-nv

The House then adjourned for lunch at thirty-one minutes pas one of the clock*

' —

The House re-assembled, after lunch, at thirty-two minutes past one of the clock.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI MD. SALIM) in the Chair

RESIGNATION OF SHRI A- K- ANTONY. MINISTER OF CIVIL SUPPLTES-Contd-

SHRI GURUDAS. DAS GUPTA (West Bengal): Sir, the House cannot be run*

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHR^ MD. SALIM): Why?

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: The Treasury Benches are empty and the Government has not considered our demand for placing the report .... *(Interruptions)*.. .It can't run- Let us adjourn ------- *(Interruptions)*...